

## Evaluation of Water Supply, Sanitation and Hygiene in Nampula Province, Mozambique (NAMWASH) MANAGEMENT RESPONSE

### Activity Summary

<b>Activity Name</b>	<b>Water Supply, Sanitation and Hygiene in Nampula Province, Mozambique (NAMWASH)</b>		
AidWorks initiative number	INK 348		
Commencement date	1 January 2012	Completion date	30 June 2014
Total Australian \$	\$5,086,040 (69% of total Phase 1 funding)		
Total (revised) planned contributions from other partners	UNICEF \$1,783,191 (24%); GoM: \$277,800 (4%); Communities: \$195,000 (3%)		
Delivery organisation(s)	UNICEF		
Implementing partner(s)	UNICEF Administração de Infra-estruturas de Abastecimento de Água e Saneamento / Office of Water and Sanitation Infrastructure ( AIAS), Mozambican Government		
Country/Region	Mozambique		
Primary sector	Water and sanitation		
Initiative objective/s	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Technical component:</b> The objective of the technical component was to increase access to safe water, effective sanitation services and improve hygiene knowledge and practices in selected secondary cities, peri-urban areas, towns and market centres. The main activities included: School Water Supply, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH), actions to improve sanitation infrastructure and behaviours in small towns, development of sanitation master plans and physical improvements to the piped water supply.</li> <li>• <b>Institutional component:</b> the primary objective of the institutional component was to increase access to water supply, sanitation and hygiene by the targeted population, through improved management of systems at local government level as well as, more generally, of sector funds and programme activities focused on, small piped water supplies and sanitation. This included the extension of Mozambique's Delegated Management Framework to smaller systems as well as the development of opportunities for local entrepreneurs. A further expected outcome was strengthened sector capacity at all levels of government to plan, coordinate, implement, supervise sector activities, document and disseminate sector lessons learned and good practices.</li> </ul>		

### Evaluation Summary

**Evaluation Objective:** The purpose of the evaluation was two-fold. Firstly for management purposes: to assess progress against Phase 1 target results and objectives and assess the suitability of the approach taken during Phase 1 to inform potential changes to the design of Phase 2. Importantly, the evaluation was also intended to inform management prior to proceeding to Phase 2. Secondly, the evaluation aimed to obtain wider learning on aid effectiveness that will result from the challenges that NAMWASH is trying to address in the nascent environment of service delivery in towns. The evaluation is also a useful source of

information on the effectiveness of the aid program to its main users, the Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade (DFAT), Government of Mozambique (GoM) and UNICEF.

**Evaluation Completion Date: 26 August 2013 (*the date when documentation from the peer review was finalised*)**

**Evaluation Team:** Mike Muller (Team Leader), Kelly Beaver (Evaluation specialist)

**DFAT shadow team:** Alice Crowley (Africa Branch Evaluation Manager), Marcus Howard (Senior Water Advisor) and Laila Smith (Senior Program Manager, Pretoria).

### **DFAT's response to the evaluation report**

The Independent Evaluation was high quality and based on a sound evaluation methodology. The evaluation report demonstrates an understanding of the project and the complexities of improving water and sanitation services in towns and urban areas in Mozambique.

The evaluation findings have been provided to UNICEF and the Government of Mozambique partner agency, AIAS, for comment. While AIAS is in full agreement with the findings of the report, UNICEF disagreed with a number of findings and recommendations and has drafted their own management response.

Overall, DFAT agrees with the findings and recommendations of the evaluation which was undertaken during the early stages of program delivery and for a limited time. DFAT also acknowledges the implications for activity sequencing due to the rapid start-up of the program and the pressure this placed on UNICEF to get the program up and running. The purpose of this evaluation was very focussed on informing DFAT management decisions and Phase 2 design and given these priorities the report has provided thoughtful analysis and useful recommendations in line with the level of detail required for this purpose. Not all aspects of the Key Evaluation Questions could be answered in detail and some areas, such as governance, coordination, gender and disability, were not comprehensively addressed.

On balance, the evaluation served as a valuable tool to stocktake progress, recommend adjustments and create a platform to discuss issues and challenges with our implementing partner UNICEF, as well as Government of Mozambique (GoM) key stakeholders, especially AIAS, regarding service delivery of water supply and sanitation in smaller towns and recently urbanised locations across Mozambique.

Since the evaluation was completed, the Australian Government has considered its policy and budget priorities for the aid program and, due to budget constraints, has decided that it is not able to proceed with support to NAMWASH Phase 2.

## DFAT's response to the specific recommendations made in the report

**NOTE:** On 1 November 2013, AusAID was merged with the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT). The NAMWASH Evaluation Report was finalised prior to the merger and any reference to AusAID below refers to the Australian aid program managed by DFAT. The recommendations were also made prior to the decision that due to budget constraints, DFAT was not able to proceed to fund Phase 2 of NAMWASH. As a result, the management response has been framed within this context and prepared against the summary recommendations from the report.

Summary of Recommendations	Response	Actions	Responsibility
<p>1. The balance between programme objectives and community demand be reviewed to guide both the allocation of financial resources and the balance between activities that focus on water supply and those that address sanitation during the second phase</p>	<p><u>Agreed-in-principle</u></p> <p>Clear benefit of ensuring appropriate and relevant program objectives from the outset in establishing an early and comprehensive dialogue with all partners, including implementing partners, the community and partner government agencies.</p> <p>The early provision of accurate water feasibility studies is critical to inform WASH program planning.</p> <p>By focussing only on sanitation investments while water supply systems are inadequate/ not operational, risks program effectiveness and reputations of all partners.</p> <p>A key element in the rationale for DFAT's support of NAMWASH has been a strong desire to focus on supporting rapid town growth in areas under urbanisation.</p>	<p>Pretoria Post has met with UNICEF management in Mozambique to clarify UNICEF's commitment to continuing to implement the growth/urbanising vision originally intended for NAMWASH for the remainder of the Program.</p> <p>UNICEF has been encouraged to continue to share lessons learned with the Government of Mozambique and other stakeholders.</p>	<p>Pretoria Post</p>

Summary of Recommendations	Response	Actions	Responsibility
<p>2. The programme should review its approach to, and targeting of, improved household sanitation to ensure clarity about the objectives, and then develop appropriate strategy and instruments to support it.</p>	<p><u>Agreed-in-principle</u></p> <p>The holistic integration of programmatic approaches to sanitation into town planning is essential to meet service delivery needs in towns more effectively.</p> <p>The unique characteristics and needs of sanitation service delivery in towns require innovative approaches. Greater information and lesson sharing by stakeholders will help improve the quality of responses to sanitation in Mozambique.</p>	<p>UNICEF and other implementing partners have been made aware of this recommendation for future programming.</p> <p>As part of its engagement on water and sanitation in southern Africa, the aid program provided the opportunity for WASH partners in Mozambique (and other partner countries) to share information and learn from each other. A final lesson sharing workshop is planned for 2014.</p>	<p>UNICEF and implementing partners</p>
<p>3. The programme make better use of existing and specifically commissioned research and plans in order to guide delivery of the programme.</p>	<p><u>Agreed-in-principle</u></p> <p>This is good practice for any program design and implementation, particularly infrastructure development.</p> <p>Programme outputs should comply with available guidelines and standards, particularly those in-country.</p>	<p>As far as possible, DFAT will share outcomes from DFAT-funded research, including through the DFAT Development Research Awards Scheme (ADRAS) with partners and other donors.</p>	<p>DFAT</p>
<p>4. Future master planning should address both water supply and sanitation, since water availability determines sanitation choices, and linkages should be made with town structure planning processes wherever possible.</p>	<p><u>Agreed-in-principle</u></p> <p>It is agreed international good practice that water programs should also address sanitation as they are inter-dependent.</p>	<p>This principle is generally accepted by DFAT for water and sanitation programs. UNICEF has been made aware of this recommendation for its future program planning.</p>	<p>DFAT and UNICEF</p>

Summary of Recommendations	Response	Actions	Responsibility
<p>5. The delivery team seek further advice at a provincial, national and international level in order to improve the programme's performance in relation to the inclusion criteria. There should be formal consultation and engagement with representatives of provincial and local gender and disability organisations.</p>	<p><u>Agreed-in-principle</u> While UNICEF has considerable experience in these areas, building strong relationships and consultative processes with representative organisations of women and people with a disability, especially at the local level, leads to improved contextually relevant solutions.</p>	<p>DFAT will provide UNICEF with its policies on gender equality and disability inclusiveness for information.</p>	<p>Pretoria Post</p>
<p>6. Coordination should be improved between the NAMWASH team and other government departments: including the departments of Health, Education and the relevant department responsible for the Nacala corridor (Department of Finance and Development).</p>	<p><u>Agreed-in-principle</u> UNICEF would benefit from building partnerships with and achieving 'buy-in' from all relevant Government agencies to improve program sustainability.  Improved liaison by all stakeholders with Mozambique's Department of Finance and Development will assist Nampula province to better capture and address the growth and urbanising service delivery challenges along the strategically important Nacala Corridor. Stakeholders should be encouraged to facilitate robust discussion and drive coordination, minimising the burden to GoM.</p>	<p>These are sound development principles for consideration by UNICEF and other donors</p>	<p>UNICEF</p>

Summary of Recommendations	Response	Actions	Responsibility
<p>7. Amendments should be considered to procurement and payment arrangements to make them more tolerant to the way small suppliers operate.</p>	<p><u>Agreed-in-principle</u></p> <p>While UNICEF has extensive experience in this area, DFAT encourages UNICEF Mozambique to review arrangements and procedures to ensure sufficient flexibility to suit local circumstances, balancing risk and effectiveness /efficiency.</p> <p>DFAT encourages UNICEF to ensure that its contracting arrangements are as effective and efficient as possible while being responsive to the local context.</p>	<p>Through sharing of the review and management response, UNICEF will be encouraged to review procurement and payment arrangements in light of recommendations in the evaluation report.</p>	<p>UNICEF</p>
<p>8. The delivery partner should improve its current monitoring and evaluation plans and processes</p>	<p><u>Agreed-in-principle</u></p> <p>Monitoring and Evaluation (M&amp;E) are an essential part of tracking program performance and impact and should be strengthened where possible and resourced appropriately. A good M&amp;E framework should be fit for purpose and not overly burdensome while supporting the partner Government.</p> <p>Independent verification of results is important to ensure value for money of program investments and sustainability.</p>	<p>For future programming, UNICEF should ensure strong local endorsement for proposed approaches and should consider reviewing its PEC approaches to strengthen the program's impact.</p>	<p>Pretoria Post/ UNICEF</p>

Summary of Recommendations	Response	Actions	Responsibility
<p>9. The accountability of AIAS for Programme outcomes should be strengthened through the development of an explicit agreement about roles and responsibilities between AIAS and AusAID. This should include clear guidance on the relationship between AIAS and UNICEF that reflects AIAS' presence on the ground and accountability to its wider national constituency.</p>	<p><u>Agreed-in-principle</u></p> <p>UNICEF's support to AIAS is part of UNICEF's broader partnership with the Government of Mozambique with its own objectives. DFAT does not intend to displace this but rather to clarify the relationship in this program.</p> <p>AIAS is a critical institution to improved delivery of water supply and sanitation in smaller towns/ urban areas in ensuring the sustainability of government systems in Mozambique.</p> <p>A clearer definition of AIAS's role and responsibilities regarding the program will provide the opportunity to further build AIAS's capacity and empower AIAS to provide strategic direction to the program and sector in Mozambique.</p>	<p>UNICEF has reviewed its partnership with AIAS in light of the findings of the evaluation.</p>	<p>UNICEF and AIAS</p>
<p>10. The project management and budget development and review process for the NAMWASH programme should be strengthened.</p>	<p><u>Agreed-in-Principle</u></p> <p>DFAT encourages UNICEF to benchmark costing information against those of other projects to ensure accurate baseline costs.</p> <p>DFAT recognises that the costs of materials and labour supply in Mozambique are strongly linked to the continuing demand and growth of the mining and extractives industries in Mozambique.</p> <p>Any contingency budget line item should be stated at the overall program level, outlining decision making processes for accessing contingency funds.</p>	<p>UNICEF is aware of the need for accurate and robust costing information.</p> <p>For future projects, DFAT will focus on the quality of costing assumptions.</p> <p>DFAT will share its principles on risk management and request that risk management discussions are included if there are any further planned supervision missions before the end of Phase I.</p>	<p>DFAT and UNICEF</p>

\*\* Unless otherwise stated, the Senior Program Manager, Water and Sanitation (Africa) at Pretoria Post will have responsibility for taking forward actions.