



Australian Government  
AusAID

## Consolidated Quality at Entry Report for Mongolia WASH in Schools and Kindergartens – UNICEF

### A: AidWorks details *completed by Activity Manager*

Initiative Name:	Water, Sanitation and Hygiene - Mongolia 2011-15		
Initiative No:		Total Amount:	\$3.19m
Start Date:		End Date:	

### B: Appraisal Peer Review meeting details *completed by Activity Manager*

Initial ratings prepared by:	Russell Harwood
Meeting date:	5 December 2011
Chair:	Paul Nichols
Peer reviewers providing formal comment & ratings:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Graham Rady</li> <li>– Marcus Howard</li> </ul>
Independent Appraiser:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Vince Keogh</li> </ul>
Other peer review participants:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Russell Harwood, North Asia Section</li> <li>– Rebecca Bryant, Counsellor, Beijing</li> <li>– Anne Lubell, Senior Policy Officer (Mongolia), Beijing</li> <li>– Darryl Jackson (Design Consultant)</li> <li>– Helen McDermott, Gender Section</li> <li>– Gilles Fagninou, Deputy Representative, UNICEF Mongolia</li> </ul>

### C: Safeguards and Commitments *(completed by Activity Manager)*

<i>Answer the following questions relevant to potential impacts of the activity.</i>		
1. Environment	Have the environmental marker questions been answered and adequately addressed by the design document in line with legal requirements under the <i>Environmental Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act</i> ?	Yes
2. Child Protection	Does the design meet the requirements of AusAID's Child Protection Policy?	Yes

<b>D: Initiative/Activity description</b> <i>completed by Activity Manager (no more than 300 words per cell)</i>	
3. Description of the Initiative/Activity	<p><b>What is it?</b></p> <p>This is a partner led design activity by UNICEF Mongolia. The project proposes to pilot water, sanitation and hygiene (WASH) practices in 12 schools and 12 kindergartens in Khuvsgul province Mongolia. The activity is designed over a period of 4 years with an estimated budget of approximately 3.19M.</p> <p>Activities within the project will include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Construction of sanitation facilities</li> <li>• Construction of water facilities</li> <li>• Hygiene behaviour change activities</li> <li>• Maintenance capacity building for the facilities</li> <li>• Work with Government of Mongolia, in particular Ministry of Education, to roll out these practices into other schools and kindergartens throughout the country</li> <li>• Draft national WASH standards for schools and kindergartens</li> </ul> <p>AusAID is proposing to fund this initiative through the Infrastructure for Growth Initiative to which the Mongolia program has access. Funding would be done through a grant mechanism, implementation would be led by UNICEF Mongolia and AusAID is expected to be an active participant in the project's governance and monitoring and evaluation.</p>
4. Objectives Summary	<p><b>What are we doing?</b></p> <p>The overarching project goals is to:</p> <p><i>Support Mongolia in Child Friendly Schools and kindergartens to enhance achievement of the Millennium Development Goals, National Development Strategy, and the UNICEF Country Programme.</i></p> <p>The project has two specific objectives:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <i>Suitable, sustainable WASH facilities and appropriate hygiene behaviours by staff and children in the target sites. 12 schools and 12 kindergartens will be targeted under this project and it will reach approximately 7,800 children and 840 staff.</i></li> <li>2. <i>Effective Government of Mongolia (GoM) mechanisms for WASH in schools and kindergartens are established.</i></li> </ol>



E: Quality Assessment and Rating *(no more than 300 words per cell)*

Criteria	Assessment	Rating (1-6) *	Required Action (if needed) ‡
1. Relevance	<p><b>Why are we doing this?</b></p> <p>While there is no country strategy for Mongolia, this initiative is aligned with AusAID priorities and with Mongolian national development priorities. This initiative strategically supports the program growth in Mongolia as it responds to a specific development priority.</p> <p>The initiative aligns with AusAID priorities by addressing 2 of the 10 development objectives found in the new aid program framework "An Effective Aid Program" which was developed following the independent review of the global aid program. Additionally, the proposed activity is in line with the AusAID initiative "Access to clean water and effective sanitation".</p> <p>Mongolia's National Development Strategy is built upon the MDGs. While Mongolia has made significant progress in achieving the MDGs, it is lagging in MDG7c: to halve by 2015 the proportion of the population without sustainable access to safe drinking water and basic sanitation.</p> <p>The PDD clearly highlights the relevance and need for support to WASH in Mongolia and a targeted geographic focus (Khuvsgul). Equally, a strong case has been made for the relevance of targeting schools and kindergartens as a means for reaching vulnerable segments of the population. Recurring WASH issues and the problem tree identified in the PDD underscore the need for improvements to the WASH sector in Mongolia.</p> <p>AusAID has no in-country presence in Mongolia and therefore relies heavily on implementation through partners. UNICEF is a strong development partner for AusAID in Mongolia, as they are well regarded by GoM, are familiar with the context, have local partnerships and networks, and have a long term engagement plan to which this project would contribute.</p>	6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Clearly outline GoM engagement with UNICEF's WASH program.</li> <li>• During early implementation, assess the information used to prioritise schools and kindergartens to confirm rigorous processes are being followed.</li> </ul>

<p><b>2. Effectiveness</b></p>	<p><i>Will it work?</i></p> <p>The first objective of the activity is well articulated and appears realistic within the project time frame. UNICEF's pilot approach is well received in Mongolia and offers the greatest potential for replication and sustainability.</p> <p>The second objective could be reworded to become an outcome - it currently appears to be output. Further, we have concerns about how this objective will be achieved, what kinds of GoM engagement activities will take place and how to ensure they are taken up by GoM. In light of the GoM's current policy review and the strong policy relationship between GoM and UNICEF, there is high potential for these WASH policies to be adopted.</p> <p>The project proposes to engage with GoM as well as non-governmental actors and the community. This is an effective approach to getting buy-in from key stakeholders, working with actors familiar with the context and contributing towards sustainability of the project.</p> <p>The selection process brings together key actors to develop selection criteria for identifying suitable schools and kindergartens. This is an effective way of identifying schools in need.</p> <p>Risk matrix in 4.10 provides a good analysis of the issues that may impact on the project. Highlights are risk of GoM buy in and difficulty of promoting changed hygiene behaviour and long term maintenance of facilities.</p>	<p>5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Clarify the institutional setting/status of the Child Development Centres (CDC). eg. how do CDCs contribute to the program?</li> <li>• Provide more nuanced analysis of the primary development problem, eg lack of water.</li> <li>• Elaborate on O&amp;M arrangements for WASH facilities. eg. Which institution has responsibility, what's their accountability, what's their incentive, what's the funding stream? Soap, toilet paper, cleaning, repairs etc – how and by whom will these be paid and provided for?</li> <li>• Include development of the Inception Report as an output by end of year 1 under Objective 3 ('Project Management') of the Logframe, with AusAID approval as one of the Verifiable Indicators.</li> <li>- See the IAR<sup>1</sup> for specific recommendations on what should be included in the Inception Report (Recommendation 9 of the IAR).</li> <li>• Mobilise a TAG at end of Year 1 to review details of the proposed strategies for effectiveness once they are detailed in the Inception Report.</li> <li>• Outcome 1.0 is identified as "common to all outputs". However Activity 1.0.1 (select sites) belongs under Objective 1 while Activity 1.0.2 "customised guidelines..." seems to belong under Outcome 1.3 (assuming it is school specific).</li> <li>• The terms 'outcome' and 'output' are interchanged between Attachment B and the Table 3.1 and should be corrected for consistency.</li> <li>• Outcomes/outputs 2.1 and 2.2 are different between PDD body and Appendix B and needs to be clarified.</li> </ul>
	<p>er: Performance Policy &amp; Systems section, QPS Branch</p>	<p>UNCLASSIFIED page 4 of 9 Template current to 30 June 2012</p>



E: Quality Assessment and Rating *(no more than 300 words per cell)*

<p><b>3. Efficiency</b></p>	<p><b>How will we do it?</b></p> <p>Working through partners is critical to the aid program to Mongolia. UNICEF is considered a strong, well positioned partner to act as an intermediary for AusAID.</p> <p>Governance of the project will include a number of key actors from Government as well as UN partners and AusAID. A Steering Committee will meet every six months to coordinate the project and provide advisory services. This will be a good platform to build relations, exchange and ensure GoM buy-in.</p> <p>The proposed local partners – World Vision, ACF, MRCS, etc are known to Post as being active civil society organisations at the grassroots level in the WASH sector. UNICEF is well positioned to act as intermediary, provide oversight to these organisations, ensure accountability and help build local capacity.</p> <p>The proposed budget fits within AusAID available funds. Costing for the project is spread over four years, with the first year costs allocated primarily to preparation (site selection, guidelines development) and actual building of hardware taking place in years 2-4. Funds are allocated to project management, M&amp;E and staff costs. Funds required for project management are reasonable but a higher allocation should be considered for M&amp;E activities.</p> <p>The implementation plan takes into consideration contextual issues, i.e. short construction season, in-Mongolia travel challenges, etc. There is a detailed work plan and once the project is approved, further detailed plans will be developed according to the project target sites.</p> <p>AusAID support of the sector, through UNICEF, will raise the profile of the sector as well as AusAID's engagement in Mongolia.</p>	<p>5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provide detailed information on implementation arrangements with partners/contractors. What are the roles/inputs of these organisations? How will they be supervised? What is their level of expertise?</li> <li>• Include analysis on the potential impacts of inflation and detail mitigation strategies – the impact of inflation on cost estimates should be included as a risk in table 4.3 of the PDD. What are the drivers of inflation? If inflation is close to 20% then we need to be more realistic about the budget. Aside from affecting installation costs, inflation could impact upon ongoing maintenance costs and jeopardise the activity's sustainability.</li> <li>• As part of the Inception Report, and by end of year 1, prepare 'Standard' or 'typical' WASH facility designs, specific for the Project (note - Attachment B of PDD notes this requirement)</li> <li>• See IAR (Recommendation 9d) for additional recommendations on what should be included in the design standards.</li> <li>• See IAR (Recommendations 4 to 7) for specific comments and recommendations on proposed technical issues mentioned in the PDD.</li> <li>• Identify a budget and funding arrangements for completion of construction in year 4. Currently no budget for construction in year 4.</li> </ul>
-----------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

2.

<sup>1</sup> IAR – Independent Appraisal Report



## E: Quality Assessment and Rating *(no more than 300 words per cell)*

### 4. Monitoring & Evaluation

#### ***How will we know?***

The PDD proposes that Project monitoring and evaluation (M&E) will be integrated into the GoM / UNICEF Integrated Monitoring and Evaluation Plan. The approach is structured around baseline data collection, monitoring activities and evaluation.

Further project specific M&E will be developed. Attachment B shows that indicators have been identified for each of the project outputs. A clear list of reports that will be produced has been outlined in the PDD.

Who will undertake the M&E is not clear; will it be led by UNICEF Mongolia or outsourced to the implementing partners? Will it include GoM representatives? Roles and involvement in M&E should be defined.

The current budget allocation of 1% of the total budget seems to be inadequate for assessing, understanding and improving performance of a significant set of behavioural change challenges.

AusAID's participation in M&E activities is imperative and could lead to further technical inputs as needed by the project.

5

- Provide more information on EMIS – is it adequately supported? In place?
- Document explicitly how UNICEF is working with the GoM on M&E, including budget details.
- AusAID acknowledges that the M&E arrangements for this activity fall within UNICEF's broader M&E plan for Mongolia. However, AusAID requests that this larger M&E plan is provided to AusAID for feedback. In the interim AusAID is confident that the arrangements that are in place are sufficient and we will continue our M&E engagement through AusAID TAG and post (Beijing) supervision. AusAID requests that UNICEF provide an update on M&E arrangements in the Inception Plan.
- Detail (in PDD and DSID) AusAID TAG and post's (Beijing) supervisory roles of the activity, including how post will work with the TAG. Include AusAID monitoring roles in M&E table.
- PDD to note AusAID TAG participation in M&E.
- AusAID TAG should at end of year 1 review the M&E arrangements, as well as design standards and the Inception Report.
- Clarify to what extent the Logframe (Attachment B of PDD) will be used as a M&E tool during the project implementation. Does it meld with UNICEF processes or operate in parallel?
- Align AusAID M&E role as defined in paragraph 173 with Table 4-1 of PDD



## E: Quality Assessment and Rating *(no more than 300 words per cell)*

<b>5. Sustainability</b>	<p><b><i>Will benefits last?</i></b></p> <p>The project has good potential for sustainability by working with GoM and local actors.</p> <p>Strategies to ensure maintenance of facilities have been built into the PDD.</p> <p>Hygiene promotion has the potential for sustained behaviour change however these activities are not as clear as they could be despite being a key component to the project.</p> <p>Sustainability is addressed as a combination of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• WASH facilities are designed to be "maintenance friendly";</li> <li>• The maintenance of WASH facilities is considered through customised guidelines that are to be followed by staff and children;</li> <li>• The formal handover process establishes certain obligations on the staff, parents and children;</li> <li>• Planning and implementation process seeks to build ownership and understanding through involvement of staff, parents and children;</li> <li>• Component 2 focuses on broader systemic changes to create an enabling environment for WASH</li> </ul>	<p>4</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provide more information on the institutional setting to support O&amp;M of the facilities and ongoing hygiene promotion.</li> <li>• AusAID monitoring to evaluate how effective the EMIS is in measuring sustainability of services including hygiene promotion.</li> <li>• UNICEF to clarify timing of hygiene promotion activity which should be commencing before the physical works in 2012.</li> <li>• What needs to change to ensure replication by GoM (post project). What's the objective regarding replication.</li> </ul>
--------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

<p><b>6. Gender Equality</b></p>	<p><i>How will we achieve gender equality?</i></p> <p>The PDD covers the gender aspects of the project very well and demonstrates significant gender sensitivity. The PDD highlights improved access to education for girls as linked to access to water and sanitation. Additionally, reference to participatory planning, equal inclusion of both male and female stakeholders to ensure that gendered perspectives are incorporated has been done well.</p> <p>The project has strong potential to have positive, gendered impacts within the target population.</p>	<p>5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provide stronger gender analysis in the justification for the activity. eg. At present there is no indication of a correlation between girls' drop-out rate and inadequate hygiene facilities. Does water carrying at also home impact upon the drop-out rate?</li> <li>• Ensure that the M&amp;E arrangements assess whether girls' needs are actually being taken into account. i.e. gender issues must not be limited to the initial consultations.</li> <li>• For the design: is there a need for wash basins in girls' toilet cubicles for sanitation purposes? Are there enough cubicles for girls (there should be more cubicles for girls than for boys)?</li> <li>• The baseline study must include gender disaggregated data.</li> <li>• Inception Report must discuss consultation with both boys and girls.</li> <li>• The TAG's TORs must incorporate gender perspectives.</li> </ul>
<p><b>7. Analysis and Learning</b></p>	<p><i>Have well have we thought this through?</i></p> <p>The project design document contains good analysis of the country context, education sector and WASH in the country. Section 2.4 in particular shows good understanding of the challenges faced in the education sector with WASH being a major problem in such a harsh climate.</p> <p>It would be useful if the design outlined what they have learned from working with central government to better understand barriers to government taking a stronger leadership role in school sanitation.</p> <p>The PDD identifies a number of lessons learnt from UNICEF Mongolia and demonstrates a good understanding of the contextual challenges and issues within the sector.</p> <p>PDD would benefit from more references made to lessons learnt from WASH activities in Mongolia, by UNICEF or other actors active in the sector.</p> <p>Additional reference to lessons learnt in working in partnership with GoM and NGOs would be beneficial.</p>	<p>4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Clarify the roles of the various GoM Ministries and the Water Authority in ongoing O&amp;M and ongoing health / hygiene promotion.</li> <li>• Explicitly define what needs to change within GoM, what are the gaps to achieving sustainability</li> <li>• AusAID should stay involved in program evaluations and how the lessons learned have been used in other programs and to inform good practice in GoM and UNICEF global CFS programs.</li> </ul>




* Definitions of the Rating Scale:			
Satisfactory (4, 5 and 6)		Less than satisfactory (1, 2 and 3)	
6	Very high quality; needs ongoing management & monitoring only	3	Less than adequate quality; needs to be improved in core areas
5	Good quality; needs minor work to improve in some areas	2	Poor quality; needs major work to improve
4	Adequate quality; needs some work to improve	1	Very poor quality; needs major overhaul

‡ **Required actions (if needed):** These boxes should be used wherever the rating is less than 5, to identify actions needed to raise the rating to the next level, and to fully satisfactory (5). The text can note recommended or ongoing actions.

F: Next Steps <i>completed by Activity Manager after agreement at the Appraisal Peer Review meeting</i>		
Provide information on all steps required to finalise the design based on <i>Required Actions</i> in "C" above, and additional actions identified in the peer review meeting	Who is responsible	Date to be done
1. UNICEF Mongolia will address the Required Actions outlined above.	UNICEF Mongolia	
2.		
3.		

G: Other comments or issues <i>completed by Activity Manager after agreement at the APR meeting</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> <li></li> </ul>

H: Approval <i>completed by ADG or Minister-Counsellor who chaired the peer review meeting</i>		
On the basis of the final agreed Quality Rating assessment (C) and Next Steps (D) above:		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <b>QAE REPORT IS APPROVED</b> , and authorization given to proceed to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><input checked="" type="radio"/> <b>FINALISE</b> the design incorporating actions above, and proceed to implementation</li> <li>or: <input type="radio"/> <b>REDESIGN</b> and resubmit for appraisal peer review</li> </ul>		
<input type="checkbox"/> <b>NOT APPROVED</b> for the following reason(s): <hr/> <hr/> <hr/>		
signed: 		76/12/11

### When complete:

- Copy and paste the approved ratings, narrative assessment and required actions into AidWorks and attach the report.
- The original signed report must be placed on a registered file

